A DIALOGICAL APPROACH TO EDUCATING CRITICAL REFLEXIVE PRACTITIONERS
MOTIVATION

- Gaps between rhetoric and practice
- Ethical project: From moral practitioners to critical thinkers
- From a cognitive and individual approach to reflection/critical reflexivity – to an embodied and dialogical approach
- Dialogue as topic and methodology
THEORETICAL OUTSET

Dialogue in meaning making and learning – a Bakhtinian "take" on dialogue
Diversity and difference as a driver for learning

Embodied nature of meaning and learning:
Multilayered visual and dialogical pedagogical strategies
TENSIONS
FROM MUDDY TO CLEARER WATER AND BACK AGAIN

Tsoukas (2009) argues that professionals get a better understanding of their practice through further articulation of what they do by becoming aware of the distinctions they have been employing, of the taken-for-granted habits they may be following, and of the associated power-laden structures that underlay their discursive practices (Tsoukas, 2009, p. 943).

This process is often emotionally ambivalent because it is no longer possible to isolate the right thing to do!
CRITICAL REFLEXIVITY

• Critical examination of basic assumptions in describing reality
• From reflection to reflexivity: from systematising/searching for "a pattern/logic and order to complexifying thinking or experience by exposing contradictions, dilemmas, doubts and possibilities" (Cunliffe, 2002, p. 38)
• Draws attention to epistemological assumptions regarding the nature of reality: Our social realities and sense of self is constructed between us in everyday interactions
• How can we be attentive to what we cannot see – i.e. tacit assumptions?
  • About struckness, discomfort and emotions (Cunliffe)
  • Investigating "moments which go wrong" (visual/auditive methodologies)
  • Learning is an embodied and responsive process that may arise from being struck
FROM A NORMATIVE TO A SITUATED ETHICS

Discursive ethics (Foucault):
Anticipating doing good (in the normative sense) can mean that we tend to ignore the potential in addressing complexity (such as the dynamics of in/exclusions processes) by examining and opening up for emergent tensions and dilemmas as they evolve in-interaction in guidance practices.

So – not only asking:
• What is in the best interest of the client? (normative)
• Why is in the best interest of the client? (normative)

But also questioning:
• How are we ”doing” social justice discursively? (situated)
THE MAN IN THE RED WEST
RELEASE THE TENSION
EMOTIONS AND REFLEXIVITY

Heen (2005) feelings can “convey quite accurate information about the outer world” and, be used as the basis for investigating hypotheses about what is at stake in emotional moments.

However:

• Emotional stuckness often/can lead to offensive, defensive, moral and emotional dynamics (dichotomize)

So

• How can we leave room for work with emotions in a constructive, respectful and ethical manner?
• How do we categorise, discuss and respond to potentially "unethical" practices?
REFERENCES


Manufacturing Content: Exploring Critical Perspectives on the Production of Labour Market Information – Tom Staunton, iCeGS, The University of Derby
Basic Thesis

- LMI has been a key part of how careers education has been discussed
- Dominant models look to a rationalistic approach which prioritises accurate information
- Chomsky and Herman - Manufacturing Consent - production of information serves political and ideological purposes
- Opens up new avenues for critical approaches to LMI
Literature Review

• Reviewed 157 articles on LMI
• Explore what metaphors or theories underpin the understanding
• Focussed on relationship between information and career development
• Created an emergent list of concepts and theoretical metaphors (see next slide)
• Coded each article with 1 - 2 metaphors
## Literature Review

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Metaphors</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adaptability</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constructivist</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contact</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nomad</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Rationalism</strong></td>
<td><strong>120</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Justice</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Rationalistic Approaches to LMI
Rationalistic/ Matching

• Rationalism routed in the work of Parsons (1909) and Holland (1973) who looked to draw measurable links between self and opportunity
• Tends to look at LMI as needing sufficient quality to enabling rational matches
• Gati (1996) has described career indecision on part being caused by a lack of information or low quality information
• Similarly Germeijs and Verschueren (2007) have explored the need for decision making to be supported by broad research and in depth exploration
Social Justice

• Increasing focus on Social Justice as a paradigm for career guidance (Hooley, Sultana and Thomsen 2018)
• Flederman (2011), Doyle (2011) and Rai (2013) all describe how disadvantaged populations have their disadvantage compounded by a lack of access to career information
• This mainly takes an equality/ equity approach which ignores critical perspectives on social justice
Manufacturing Consent
Manufacturing Consent

- Herman and Chomsky (1988)
- Whilst Soviets coerced through power American Capitalism coerces through ideology
- Controlling what is and is not possible to think e.g. Vietnam
- News can be accurate but still ideologically constructed
- Media relies on official information and ‘expert’ opinion
Manufacturing Consent

• LMI has a “system supporting” function i.e. it operates as ideology
• Comes from an ‘official’ or ‘expert’ position
• Presents work as neutral, individual, socialising and progressive
• Silences work as social, environmental, nihilistic & dangerous
Critical Perspectives
Critical Perspectives

• Sultana (2013) identified four traditions in social justice - harmony, equality, equity and pluralism.
• Pluralism - social justice can be linked to ‘difference’ and ‘hospitality’ individuals do no need to ‘become’ to be human.
• Resists the view that information should be used for individuals to progress in their careers.
• Instead look at how our current understandings of information and work construct boundaries.
• Links with Herman and Chomsky’s ‘system supporting’ thesis.
Challenging Boundaries

Some sites where the boundaries of what we learn about work can be challenged:

- **Individual vs. Social** - work is done with and for others
- **Extractive vs. Environmental** - work connects us to the natural world
- **Progressive vs. Humane** - we do not need work to become human but express our humanity through work
- **Neutral vs. Exploitive** - work frequently is a sight of violence
Conclusion

Some ways forward:

• Think about what we see as ‘good’ information
• Need to approach what we need information about differently
• Need to develop models of practice based around learning ‘about’ career as well as learning to ‘develop’ career
Contact

t.staunton@derby.ac.uk
@tomstaunton84
https://runninginaforest.wordpress.com
References


References


Roadmaps and momentums of success: Upper secondary school students’ motivations and experiences of how to succeed in school

Following footprints of resilient youth: successful educational trajectories and transition into higher education

Associate professor, Carina Carlhed Ydhag, Stockholm University
Professor Niclas Månsson, Södertörn University

Director: Ali Osman, Associate professor, Stockholm University
Following footprints of resilient youth: successful educational trajectories and transition into higher education

- The research project aims to examine the mechanisms and factors that contributed to the academic success of students from households with high or low educational background, and parents with high or low income, migrant or of non-migrant background.

- The research project focuses on how these students attained academic disposition that allowed to them to embark on a successful academic trajectory.

- 4-year project, qualitative longitudinal (Swedish Research Council)
Rationale

- A blind spot in research is the growing percentage of high achievers from low income household.

- These students challenge the idea that poverty, racism/discrimination and low educational performance are linked.

- In educational literature, these students are referred to as educationally resilient.

- This project builds on and seeks to expand upon the deficit explanatory model which explain the failure of these of students’ on their lack of cultural capital.
The focus of this specific study

- The presentation deals with a subtheme on the students’ own stories of how they succeed in school and what is driving them to perform well.

- The results are based on in-depth interviews with 52 students in upper secondary school, 19 male and 33 female.

- The sample is a broad mix of students with different national backgrounds and mixed resources in terms of socioeconomic and educational capital.

- For this particular study, we focus on their own stories of how they succeed in school and what is driving them to perform well.
Teachers relations to students – focusing on differences

- High achievers with high cultural capital (middle class or upper middle class):
  - gets more attention from the teachers
  - govern their own education by negotiation with the teachers

- Low achievers with low cultural capital (working class):
  - gets less attention from the teachers
  - Trust the teachers and do not ask the teacher more than they have to

= Teachers action – creates or maintains a negative school culture among working class
Teachers relations to students – focusing on different aspects

Because children and youth from the (upper) middle class benefits from the schools system and school culture, does not mean that socioeconomical background is determinated

Relation to school varies between different variables

Not only working class children that nutures a anti-school culture

There is a pro-school culture parallell to a negative one (even among working class)

School purpose along with plans for the future is desicive
Focusing on different kinds of support

- Emotional support from parents and the family – more important than material support
- Ideational support – from significant others
- Social support among friends – nurtures social capital
- A good school culture with supporting mentors
- A supporting, visible, and accountable leadership from school administration
- Support from the community – builds a better school environment
Analytic framework

- Our analytical focus can allow us to shed light on the complex interplay between social and cultural resources activated by these students in their encounter with the school practices.

- To delineate these resources, the analytical framework of the project builds on studies using Coleman’s (1988) and Bourdieu’s (1977) understanding of social capital and in addition concept of *habitus* and *illusio* (Ibid.).

- In order to analyze the mechanisms and factors that allow the students examined in this paper to achieve academic success, it is first necessary to identify the social and material resources that these students mobilize.
Preliminary findings I

**Reasons for seeking success**

‘Revanche’ –
- ‘to override low expectations’,

- ‘repay of parent’s sacrifices’

- ‘to allow yourself to pursue your dream’

‘Compliance to high expectations’

‘Fear of failing – the gates of higher education are closing’

‘Entitlement’

‘Idea of a professional self in the future’

‘Become knowledgeable’

**Practices in investing time and energy**
Preliminary findings II

- Practices in investing time and energy
  - Take responsibility of your own success
  - Devote time and energy (in school and outside school)
  - Find and make use of resources (people/online resources)
    - General support (stable relationships, unconditional support, nourishing environment)
    - Specific support (reduce stress, manage negative thinking, concrete help with school-work)
  - Design the environment
    - Reduce distractions
    - Choose courses wisely
    - Change class if it's necessary
    - Choose motivated peers
  - Fight – do not give up
Preliminary conclusions

- Unconditional support from somebody is crucial
- Students with low educational capital are more dependent on teachers, school supporting activities and their peers
- Students with immigrant background express specific illusio – revanche and repay parents’ sacrifices
- … and more to come
Thank you for your attention!